

Daniel Yablonsky: **Is this a “pilot” or a “proposed pilot”? Has it already been decided that this is going forward without speaking to the community?

Sam Spearing : Christina Howell, Executive Director christina@bloomfieldpgh.org
Sam Spearing, Housing & Mobility Coordinator sam@bloomfieldpgh.org
Call us at 412-681-8800

Matt Sandler: How can we ensure transparency in what data is collected by the robots, how it is shared, and have control/say over what data is shared and have a say in whom it is shared/sold to? Especially worried as a resident about encroaching privatization of our public spaces, and it getting into the wrong hands (ie: ICE).

Sam Spearing: Hi all thanks for sharing questions in the chat! We'll get to Q&A a little later in the meeting and will be reviewing questions posted in the chat.

Paul O'Hanlon: How wide are these robots? How wide are the sidewalks they'll be permitted to operate on? Who has determined that this can be done without reducing accessibility for people with disabilities?

Paul O'Hanlon: Robots aren't protected by the Americans with Disabilities Act.

DJ Stemmler: Well protected class sometimes doesn't have an impact as demonstrated in other initiatives

Mel Packer: If a pedestrian refuses to step aside for a robot or stands in the way of a robot, does that become a punishable offense under city statutes given that the State of PA has apparently granted the same rights to robots as to humans?

Larissa Lola: Will they be delivering food or items? Have you factored how small businesses in Pgh and serving your area will be impacted by allowing robots to replace people for employees? Small businesses that also can't afford robots to complete work? Big box, fat cats - Uber, Amazon, GrubHub vs. small, local Mom & Pops, like HappyBelliesPgh.com, local restaurants and shops?

Daniel Yablonsky: Do we have data about that increased delivery trend?

Mel Packer: The demand for these comes solely from the companies as, given the unemployment rate and the rise of the gig economy, there is no problem finding humans to deliver goods who need those jobs and income.

Evan R: So we have something weighing 550lbs going at a 5 minute mile down the sidewalks?

Xander Orenstein (they/them): In other cities with self-mobilizing technology or mobile unsupervised technology, citizens have had trouble with corporations initiating litigation against them for tampering with the technology for any unauthorized contact with the technology, including moving them for public safety. How will we ensure that this will not become a similar problem for our community?

Dan Barrett: Agreed, Dan and Mel. And why would increased food delivery demand automatically necessitate automated delivery robots owned and operated by private companies, for profit?

Daniel Yablonsky: Just a note that looking at that image, the robot is taking the smoothest path on the sidewalk. Which would certainly be where pedestrians would be walking.

Olivia Ciotoli: I am a small business owner and also deliver food as a side job to help make ends meet. What are the benefits of these robots to the community? From what I can tell, they are just taking over my source of income.

Alex Benamy: ^^^

Paul O'Hanlon: Just as a point of reference, when I go max speed in my power wheelchair, that's 7-8 mph max. These devices can go 50% than me speeding past you!

Mary Weidner: I think it's important to try things out. It's a pilot program, not a forever commitment.

Maura Bainbridge: what does "restricted" mean- how is that enforced?

Mel Packer: If I rode my bike at 12mph on a sidewalk, pedestrians would justifiably stand in my way, knock me over, or I would hurt someone. That speed is absurd.

Dan Barrett: The framing of this issue by DOMI is deeply troubling. The City of Pittsburgh is no stranger to challenging state law regarding its ability to regulate local issues. It's unfortunate this *political* question is being framed by DOMI and others as a technical and managerial one... as if privatization and automation was a foregone conclusion, not an ideological decision - that allowing for-profit companies to do whatever they want in the public right-of-way is always a good thing.

DJ Stemmler: Unfortunately Pilot programs are not data driven all the time.

Olivia Ciotoli: I'm seeing the traffic/pedestrian rules they must follow, but I've seen them do.....not that. They do not seem to have advanced enough automation to follow the rules.

Mel Packer: DOMI should be fighting FOR us and not FOR private corporations hoping to do

away with jobs and give control of our environment to robots.

Mary Weidner: It's a max speed. I think it's disingenuous to think that it's going to be speeding 12mph and blowing through people without any care. Obviously they are taking this into account.

Alex Benamy: then why allow them to go 12 mph?

Paul O'Hanlon: exactly

Daniel Yablonsky: Erin, there is not a "prohibition" on Municipalities regulation. As Christina said at the start of this presentation, municipalities have the ability to restrict PDDs if they consider them a hazard to pedestrians.

https://www.penndot.gov/Doing-Business/Documents/PDD%20Policy_final.pdf

Christine Hunsinger: I'd like sidewalks that move so I can get somewhere at twelve miles an hour too.

Daniel Yablonsky: You only get that if you can afford to go to the airport.

Mel Packer: And, as Dan points out, we should do exactly that. Telling us this is coming and alerting us to this is NOT community engagement, but community enforcement.

katherine vargo: How was Bloomfield identified for the pilot?

Evan R: What guarantee is there that these companies operate at slow speeds? Is that a municipal legislation we can pass that overrides state legislation?

Theresa Tran: I just imagine getting hit by a full full-sized fridge, but those robots weigh more which is ridiculous

Abhishek Viswanathan: Who asked for this?

Xander Orenstein (they/them): I am concerned that these might be dangerous to pets as well

Dan Barrett: Private companies asked for this... and got exactly what they wanted

Olivia Ciotoli: Is Kiwibot a local company?

Mel Packer: IT will be interesting to watch them negotiate their way through the lunch crowd and canopy at Donatelli's or the fruit and vegetable market at Merante's.

Paul O'Hanlon: Have these devices been pre-tested with people with disabilities on the target

sidewalks . . . first?

Evan R: What enforcement would there be for companies who violate local policies? With big companies like Amazon, who have shown they can view fines as 'cost of doing business', moving these into the area, what power would the neighborhood be able to use?

David Maynard: What community needs are not being met by couriers currently?

Jennifer Haven: How was Kiwi Bot chosen? Is this a public private partnership?

Christine Hunsinger: You know that there were similar arguments when vehicles not on tracks started running on streets.

Abhishek Viswanathan: How is this "community-driven" if no community members asked for this, the meetings come in AFTER deployment, and there is no route for veto-ing this?

David Maynard: I think the baseline question is clear, what purpose do these machines serve other than resource extraction from our communities?

Evan R: Christine, the end of development of tracked and shared vehicles is one of the greatest tragedies of modern American infrastructure

Olivia Ciotoli: Yes the PDDs can do all these deliveries, but so can humans on bikes or even on foot. And those humans can be paid money. During a global pandemic when so many people are facing unemployment, why are we giving that job to robots?

Dan Barrett: Why in the world would residents spend time dreaming up uses for private, for-profit robots to make money for corporations by using our public rights-of-way?

Maura Bainbridge: agreed, @olivia!

Xander Orenstein (they/them): I did some quick math - these things can hit with an energy of 65.8 kilojoules, which is 16x times more than is needed to break a femur

DJ Stemmler: Could we do the same thing with Grant money that goes to homeless, unemployed or disabled?

Gabriel McMorland: I'm blind and i have safety concerns, and it's going to be pretty disorienting when i try to interact with the obstacle on sidewalk or in crosswalk

Gabriel McMorland: I also work at a nonprofit that has had success with volunteers making deliveries

Alex Benamy: these people clearly have a great grasp on tech

Maura Bainbridge: @Gabriel- what an excellent **community building** activity!!

Nina Gibbs: I know there were issues with these in Oakland with them blocking intersections and being difficult for those with disabilities. What has been changed to fix that?

Olivia Ciotoli: I agree with DJ, why can't the grant money go to other issues with mobility, such as fixing the sidewalks so theyre safer and better for disabled folks.

Theresa Tran: ^^

Paul O'Hanlon: ^^

Jennifer Haven: Who applied for the grant, and what restrictions have been placed on its use?

Maura Bainbridge: Extracting research to facilitate money making?

Daniel Yablonsky: (Learning lessons about how to make money)

Alex Benamy: Bragging about taking money from gig workers lol

Mel Packer: The goal of corporations is ALWAYS about cutting employees and making more profits, despite all the liberal platitudes coating the presentations.

Evan R: How does introducing delivery robots that do the job that could be done by Pittsburghers help small businesses?

Nina Gibbs: What will be the delivery radius of these vehicles in the first stage?

Daniel Yablonsky: ^^ great point, Evan.

Nina Gibbs: I am from Garfield and work for the Bloomfield-Garfield Corporation

Mel Packer: I live in Pt Breeze but shop a lot in Bloomfield.

Paul O'Hanlon: How many people with disabilities have been / will be hired to test to see if these things are sidewalk-worthy?

DJ Stemmler: Question: Can you be clear who funded the grant and who got the grant.

Sam Spearing: Christina Howell, Executive Director christina@bloomfieldpgh.org
Sam Spearing, Housing & Mobility Coordinator sam@bloomfieldpgh.org

Call us at 412-681-8800

Daniel Yablonsky: Is Erin the only City staff person in this meeting?

Christina Howell: As far as I know

Jennifer Kiley: I live and work in Bloomfield. Prior to implementing a Pilot here, are there any best practices in place for the use of these devices? It would be helpful if we had info from the use of these devices in other places.

Daniel Yablonsky: we can tell that to companies without having a pilot....

Mel Packer: Human beings making deliveries can climb steps, go into the dwelling if requested AND even discover that the person ordering delivery may need medical help. A robot will simply leave.

Maura Bainbridge: Excellent point Mel!!!!

Paul O'Hanlon: Who applied for that funding?

Dan Barrett: There are thousands of grant opportunities from foundations in the US available every year, along with state and federal grant opportunities. Why did the City apply for this opportunity?

David Breingan: Did the City of Pittsburgh or DOMI specifically join with PCRG and many community groups in Pittsburgh in (unsuccessfully) asking the Governor to veto the state bill that made this possible? - Dave, Lawrenceville

Mel Packer: We all need MORE human contact, not less, or the "lonely" world that is growing will only get worse. Human contact, even with strangers delivering parcels, helps develop empathy, caring, and community.

Maura Bainbridge: or better yet @Mel- use those experiences to turn strangers into strong community

Nina Gibbs: These should have been questions asked and answered before the state vote.

Daniel Yablonsky: We can have these discussions without helping companies release this untested tech on city streets.

Daniel Yablonsky: **excuse me, sidewalks.

Nina Gibbs: What sort of data is collected by the robots?

Maura Bainbridge : Why are these meetings not subject to sunshine laws like other state agencies?

DJ Stemmler : Legislation passed without anyone knowing?

Christina Howell : Nina we all agree - it's inexcusable that there wasn't time for community engagement around this legislation

Paul O'Hanlon : The City has a duty under Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act to take no action which would REDUCE accessibility for people with disabilities to the sidewalks. Has the City determined that these devices will not REDUCE accessibility? When and how did they do that?

Mary Weidner : I'm in favor of getting cars out of the street. It seems like a good solution for deliveries over small distances that cars aren't great for anyway. I already deal with delivery vehicles blocking roads. At least I could walk around the bots.

Emily Ackerman : not everyone can walk around the robots

Paul O'Hanlon : Mary, I use a wheelchair, I can't walk around them

Dan Barrett : Obviously, noise after a certain hour isn't a great thing either. We want our community members to be safe, but we also don't need additional noise.

Daniel Yablonsky : ** bicycles also work well for deliveries over short distances

Jennifer Haven : Do the bots have "license plates" so the community can file formal complaints regarding a certain bot or bot operator?

Christine Hunsinger : Perhaps they will use bicycle bells so we will think of them as bikes.

DJ Stemmler : The devices have been tested in Oakland so ...

DJ Stemmler : What do you mean hasn't been tested?

Nina Gibbs : ^^^^ Thats what I thought as well.

Maura Bainbridge : but they can't share that data DJ- this is about data, not money!!

DJ Stemmler : It was presented to several groups

Daniel Yablonsky : What was people's experience in Oakland?

DJ Stemmler : Exactly

DJ Stemmler : It has been tested

Bonnie Fan : Did the city learn anything from their FedEx urban freight cargo bike delivery pilot?

Why put people in harm's way with this pilot when the classification of robots as pedestrians make residents liable to companies as Xander mentioned? Shouldn't the priority be advocating against this pre-emption at the state level? And has documented effects of reducing accessibility?

Mary Weidner : As for the comments on it replacing jobs- Uber/Lift are struggling to get drivers currently- see here:

<https://arstechnica.com/tech-policy/2021/04/uber-and-lyft-struggle-with-driver-shortage-as-demand-soars/>

DJ Stemmler : Dave you Rock, good points

Dan Barrett : Exactly, David!

Paul O'Hanlon : Emily has her hand raised -

<https://nationalcenterformobilitymanagement.org/what-can-we-learn-from-emily-ackermans-fight-with-a-sidewalk-robot/>

Barbara Adams : Re: Robot sounds: Need to consider needs of hearing impaired or deaf pedestrians, as well as those who are visually impaired or blind.

Alex Benamy : if we think this is a predetermined reality why are we cooperating with the companies that will be foisting it upon us?

Abhishek Viswanathan : how come ya boi david isn't chiming in even with all these opportunities to, and how come DOMI is jumping to this project's defense?

Daniel Yablonsky : Its no surprise that uber and Lyft are struggling to find drivers.... The work is hard, the pay is too low, and there are no protections.... This race to the bottom on workers rights benefits no-one.

Alex Benamy : cause David is a shill

Alex Benamy : not my man David M, he is a chad

Evan R : ^

Andrew Moss : fewer cars on the road

Evan R : Do we suspect Amazon will take less money than what the Market has dictated?

Mel Packer : This will not reduce cars as these are short range deliveries that would be done by couriers on foot or on bikes.

Maura Bainbridge : If we have so many problems with how the delivery companies do it, why are we jockeying to join them? Why aren't we spending this time to make sure those things don't happen!

DJ Stemmler : I don't think those percentages are accurate. Again DATA, DATA, DATA

Daniel Yablonsky : The City should consider a threat to jobs a hazard.

Maura Bainbridge : So why don't we go after those companies?

DJ Stemmler : No it isn't 40%, where are we getting that info?

Cian Pallasch | Office of Rep Innamorato : Question for Erin and David: what has been done so far to engage the elderly and people with disabilities in modeling the pilot program?

Evan R : If a restaurant knows that people will buy their goods at a ~40% markup for delivery, why would they willingly sell it for less when the cost of delivery labor is less? They would be losing money. Why are we assuming that a business will choose to take a profit loss?

Paul O'Hanlon : So, if I'm elderly or disabled and need a delivery to my door, up a flight of steps - these devices will mean that fewer places will deliver in a way that works for me.

DJ Stemmler : So when Grant money runs out for this Pilot program what will be the percentage or costs

Mel Packer : Again, because it doesn't deliver TO someone but only to the sidewalk in front of their dwelling, it does NOT take the place of a human being.

DJ Stemmler : It doesn't have costs now but it will. All grants convert to fee for service or customer cost.

Paul O'Hanlon : But if it's cheaper, then they'll cut out the human and offer us a less accessible system - thanks

Bonnie Fan : It seems like the pilot is to determine business opportunities more than address safety and accessibility concerns

Paul O'Hanlon : ^^

Evan R : It's sounding to me like the program is inevitable thanks to state legislature favoring big business, so I'm interested in what sort of legislation and rulings we actually can put in place.

Olivia Ciotoli : I may have to jump off before I can ask my question. I am a Bloomfield resident. I'd like to ask if the robots have cameras on them, and what will be done to respect folks' privacy/avoid surveillance concerns? For example, Ring doorbell cameras have partnered directly with hundreds of police forces. What is the likelihood of this happening with the food delivery robots?

Olivia Ciotoli : for reference:

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/2019/08/28/doorbell-camera-firm-ring-has-partnered-with-police-forces-extending-surveillance-reach/>

Nina Gibbs : Thank you Olivia!^^^ this is part of my data question. I hope there is an answer.

Daniel Yablonsky : Check out Emily's op-ed that she published after being trapped in crosswalk in Oakland during DoMI's first delivery robot pilot: My Fight With a Sidewalk Robot: <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-11-19/why-tech-needs-more-designers-with-disabilities>

Abhishek Viswanathan : ^^^

Larissa Lola : There is a local, small business that had the lowest rates to help local restaurants and serve the community and employs drivers. Happy Bellies. First the big box Uber and GrubHub, then you'll do this for free 6 months, push out the little guy and then hike rates. Many people on this call are customers and even employees. We also have regular customers who are elderly and disabled and they depend on us to eat daily.

Nina Gibbs : Thank you for sharing that article Daniel

Emily Ackerman : Can I re-unmute? I accidentally muted

Daniel Yablonsky : It seems like so far everything that's been cited as something DoMI is looking to learn could be accomplished through conversation.

Larissa Lola : *has the lowest rates

Paul O'Hanlon : Before Space X put humans on the top of rockets, they tested them. Why

hasn't the City tested them before this pilot?

Alex Benamy : What *exactly* is DOMI looking to learn from KIWI that makes this pilot beneficial to the Community? Cause this seems like a very vague motivation

Abhishek Viswanathan : What about no relationship or an oppositional relationship? this 'close-relationship' is not as inevitable or beneficial as you make it seem?

Paul O'Hanlon : Hire a dozen people with various disabilities seems like the kind of thing that should happen before they are let loose on the public

Olivia Ciotoli : Emily is right!!!

Mary Weidner : My understanding is that this can come regardless of this pilot happening so they just want the most information they can get about it

Alex Benamy : yeah but what information tho

Bonnie Fan : Exactly, Pittsburgh residents bear the costs of this pilot

Gabriel McMorland : Calling the cops often puts people in unnecessary danger, especially Black people. We should think about how this interacts with that. I haven't thought about this until lots of people keep bringing this up in our meeting tonight

Alex Benamy : not pretty fast, a full sprint is 12 mph

Evan R : I got some pretty strong doubts the company employs people running 5 minute miles

Maura Bainbridge : Ludicrous is where we are with this Mel!

Alex Benamy : Preach, Mel

Gabriel McMorland : Could other companies robots share video feeds with law enforcement for facial recognition surveillance?

Olivia Ciotoli : Mel yes!!!! 🙌

Evan R : Well said, Mel

Larissa Lola : Thank you, Mel!

DJ Stemmler : Mel for president!

Larissa Lola : and, thank you, Emily! your voice is heard by us, if not by the State!

Alex Benamy : ^^

Maura Bainbridge : how can you ensure people call DOMI and not cops?

Alex Benamy : Why ask for clarity instead of just telling these companies to kick rocks

Cassandra Masters : Along with Maura's point, how fast can DOMI respond if it's causing a major accessibility issue? 311 requests for blocked sidewalks can take days

Jennifer Kiley : What if one of these devices just stops in the middle of an intersection, such as the Main. Liberty, Bloomfield Bridge?

Evan R : Same, Mel

Mel Packer : Frankly, if an encounter with one of these resulted in damage to a human or charges against a human for damaging the robot, I think a very good lawyer would have a wonderful time taking DOMI to court for failure to answer all these legal questions before allowing this project/pilot to start.

Maura Bainbridge : and what will they do with the data they collect?

DJ Stemmler : These bots do take video, this was proven with the Oakland incident when they played back encounters for us

David Maynard : What kind of data would point to future deployments of these vehicles? What are the KPI's?

Mel Packer : Governments and corporations have told us for years that they "don't retain data" and we've usually discovered that's a lie.

Alex Benamy : Yeah the whole "doesn't store video" sounds like a load of BS

Nina Gibbs : Could you collect sidewalk and road data while its traveling? What data would the future deployment be allowed to collect. I understand this program won't but the future seems to be really important to think about. Good and bad.

Daniel Yablonsky : I again want to mention, we can work through all of these questions without putting untested tech in public spaces with our neighbors. This conversation is important to have, it needs to be had, but having robots on sidewalks is absolutely not a necessary part of having them. (neither is a Knight Foundation grant, frankly... fostering inclusive community dialogue is the point of City gov)

Evan R : It doesn't store video, just thousands of still images every second

Alex Benamy : lmao

Jodi Lincoln : Shouldn't there be a engage pgh page for public feedback? You have the platform already

Maura Bainbridge : How will you hold them responsible to answering questions?

Daniel Yablonsky : ...why isn't this already in place? Its so clear that so much has happened without any community feedback. Really doesn't give any confidence that community will be first in this planning process....

Nina Gibbs : Where will is the proposed station location in Bloomfield. I live in Garfield at the top of the hill and the Bloomfield farmers market is exactly a mile from my house.

Mary Weidner : While there are plenty of valid concerns that need more thought, I think there really isn't enough focus on the benefits. Getting supplies from local businesses to people who can't drive, removing cars from the road, lowering emissions, giving our local businesses the opportunities for getting new business and delivery options, getting our own thoughts in the testing process rather than relying on other communities' input, for example. After caring for an elderly family member, it would be great to be able to send them things to be delivered the same day- even better to buy it from a local store instead of Amazon.

David Maynard : How can community members get access to the schematics and capabilities of these machines so we can stay informed about their deployment?

Maura Bainbridge : Does that mean that the robots won't operate when it's snowing? snow is a large reason why some folks might need a delivery

Abhishek Viswanathan : do these devices not operate in the snow? why not try it in the most trying conditions after legitimate community accountability processes?

Jennifer Haven : Shouldn't we want the bots to operate in snow? It snows it Pgh. People need delivery of necessities in snow

Abigail Gildea : I think the city needs to get creative. Not host a single community meeting but host multiple community workshops.

Nicholas Trombola : When is the pilot set to begin and end?

Alex Benamy : how can you argue these things help access but don't have the ability to travel in snow. what a joke

Daniel Yablonsky : Nicholas, from what Emily just said, It sounds like they've been planning a 6-month project starting in June.

Mel Packer : Again, the legal rights and responsibilities of humans who may encounter one of these should be answered BEFORE deployment. Otherwise, it's a legal quagmire.

Alex Benamy : Erin work the mute

Alex Benamy : thank you

Abhishek Viswanathan : Am I understanding correctly that Erin's job is the ONE (1) full-time job that this project creates while creating ALL the other issues?

Alex Benamy : So we don't even know what we want to figure out, why are we going through with this?

Daniel Yablonsky : Can the grant pay disabled people and seniors for sharing their valuable expertise on solving mobility issues?

Nina Gibbs : But what are the limits to that data collection once the tight relationship isn't there? Can they collect anything they want?

Nina Gibbs : That's a great Question Dan

Mel Packer : The longer I stay on here and think about this, the more I become stunned that the City's Legal Dept is allowing this to go forward without resolving the legal issues that many of us have raised. It seems to me that the City is taking on a large legal risk that leaves it open to lawsuits for not doing its due diligence.

DJ Stemmler : so the legislation did originate with Domi?

Sam Spearing : You can view the PennDOT PDD Operations Policy here:
https://www.penndot.gov/Doing-Business/Documents/PDD%20Policy_final.pdf

Mel Packer : I believe the legislation originated with the corporations that would like to deploy these everywhere and have made sure they will rule over human rights.

DJ Stemmler : But Erin just said she worked on this after the oakland "pilot"

Daniel Yablonsky : What will we be able to answer by testing the bots that we can't answer through community conversation?

Evan R : Bit insulting that the legislature that wasn't discussed with city representatives, but was discussed with a company that will be utilizing this technology. And that the city seems to be (able to?) put up just as much of a non-fight to the corporations

Maura Bainbridge : Didn't the mayor's office congratulate our area for their success with snow angel program- connecting neighbors for snow removal?

Jennifer Haven : DOMI keeps stating, "if they are going to come here regardless..." but what is the Mayor, DOMI and the city solicitor doing to represent us at the state level?

Mel Packer : It's the same legislature that passed laws that prohibits cities from banning plastic bags. Corporate owned.

Jennifer Haven : It's a \$1,000 fine

Sam Spearing : Maura, the Snow Angel's award did go to our wonderful colleagues at Bloomfield-Garfield Corporation (Shout out to Nina who's with us tonight)

Daniel Yablonsky : For anyone interested the history of how corporations pushed forward this corporate-friendly delivery device legislation in states across the US, check out this WIRED article: <https://www.wired.com/story/amazon-fedex-delivery-robots-your-sidewalk/>

Evan R : Christina, I re-muted myself if you could help me out. Thanks

Mel Packer : Current city code states that sidewalks must be cleared of snow and ice within 24 hours of the accumulation. I would suspect that this code might actually be enforced (it's not now) as soon as the robot companies find it a problem.

Abby Rae LaCombe : @mel, when robots need the sidewalk you'd better be responsive... wheel chairs?? meh.

Nina Gibbs : Maybe the devices could let the plow truck know its heavy and come clean the street as well. Also the city is the largest property owner I think their sidewalks will come into question.

Nina Gibbs : How will it be decided and when if Bloomfield is the location?

Abhishek Viswanathan : David @ Kiwibot couldn't even keep his camera on or (non)-answer more than 2 questions.

Maura Bainbridge : What about the real harm Emily pointed out could happen before you figure that out!

Abhishek Viswanathan : "community-driven" project alright. the surveillance tech-dystopia is here.

Jennifer Kiley : Where else has Kiwibot operated? What have they learned?

Paul O'Hanlon : unproven benefit, unproven technology,, no evidence of due-diligence on the part of the City

Bonnie Fan : Is this the same grant that was awarded in 2018 or 2019 to "demystify" autonomous vehicles after pushback from residents?

Jennifer Haven : Kiwibot has made over 100,000 deliveries per their website

Evan R : lol

David Maynard : It's pretty clear these guys are using investment/grant money to enter into the market and outcompete everyone at a loss then raise prices when humans have been driven out of business. I find it very telling that we never got a hard answer about what the price point would end up being.

Alex Benamy : David was getting fried in the chat and decided to bounce lol

Emily Ackerman:

<https://techcrunch.com/2020/07/21/kiwibot-delivery-robots-head-to-san-jose-with-new-partners-s-hopify-and-ordermark/> they are semi-autonomous per this article, the human steps in when needed

Nina Gibbs : Is that the group in Oakland?

Daniel Yablonsky : The company that cares so much about working with the community left the community meeting early?

Alex Benamy : "When needed" doing a lot of heavy lifting

Sam Spearing : Yes Nina!

Christina Howell : Nina yes, Starship operates in Oakland

Sam Spearing : Starship was the company that operated in Oakland

Jennifer Kiley : Does Kiwibot have any information to share about their operations?

Maura Bainbridge : Yeah Paul!

David Maynard : Absolutely, I'm waiting on the class action lawsuit this will create

Alex Benamy : 100%

Emily Ackerman : Thanks, Paul!

Abhishek Viswanathan : Why just follow up with one person outside of public accountability? Multiple people have confirmed this already from the Oakland roll-out.

Bonnie Fan : The creation of multiple traffic circles in the new neighborways that DOMI is deploying is also terrible for visually impaired pedestrians

Maura Bainbridge : Thanks for that Christina!

Nina Gibbs : Will Erin provide answers in writing to the questions in the chat that can go on the website?

Nina Gibbs : I look forward to the engage pgh on this project and would like that to go up before the project launches

Christina Howell : Nina we'll do our best to get them answered and on the website as part of the notes.

David Maynard : Thank you Christina!

Nina Gibbs : Thank you so very much!!! Thank you so much Bloomfield Development for putting this meeting on and handling this work!!! Thank you Christina and Sam

Christina Howell : Thanks, Nina! This is a BIG deal for residents everywhere.

Eileen Kraus-Dobratz : Thank you for this. I do believe that this is a really good idea to try to get info in this way before the onslaught of other larger companies who will be protected by state law and not care about us.

Evan R : Makes sense, if they're required to pilot something on the roads.

Barbara Adams : Yes, but a licensed driver normally does not operate several vehicles simultaneously.

Jodi Lincoln : Do a poll?

Evan R : Absolutely, I'm just saying that it makes sense to require a license if they're going to

operate (a) vehicle(s) on the road

David Maynard : ^^^^

Jennifer Kiley : Thanks to all. Appreciate the forum and thoughtful questions and answers. Looking forward to detailed notes. Appreciate all of the helpful links.

Nina Gibbs : Even the electric scooters will require a driver's license.

katherine vargo : thank you BBC

Paul O'Hanlon : It is a kind of commercialization of sidewalks - like sidewalk dining. The City needs to control both.

Mel Packer : Thanks to everyone for great comments and thoughts. Gotta go. Stay involved.

Sam Spearing : Christina Howell, Executive Director christina@bloomfieldpgh.org

Sam Spearing, Housing & Mobility Coordinator sam@bloomfieldpgh.org

Call us at 412-681-8800

Nina Gibbs : Can the city go ahead and launch an engagepgh page on it?

Jennifer Kiley : Nina Gibbs - Scoobi requires that you have a valid PA DL to rent their scooters.

Nina Gibbs : The healthy ride bikes will be the same when they go electric

Diana Stoughton : Thank you everyone who contributed to this discussion

bruce chan : erin.clark@pittsburghpa.gov

Erin Clark | DOMI : erin.clark@pittsburghpa.gov

Sam Spearing : Christina Howell, Executive Director christina@bloomfieldpgh.org

Sam Spearing, Housing & Mobility Coordinator sam@bloomfieldpgh.org

Call us at 412-681-8800

David Maynard : Thank you to the BBC and Erin! I appreciate the opportunity to stay informed and voice our concerns

Nina Gibbs : Will they operate in neighborways

Nina Gibbs : Bye!!!

Evan R : Thank you for hosting!